

Fachgruppe für Volkswirtschaftslehre Economic Research Group

# VOLKSWIRTSCHAFTLICHE DISKUSSIONSBEITRÄGE

# WORKING PAPERS IN ECONOMICS

Friedrich L. Sell and Michael Öllinger

On the distributional effects of minimum wages. A note

28. Jg. (2017), Nr. 3

# Autoren/Authors

#### Michael Öllinger

Universität der Bundeswehr München / Bundeswehr University Munich Institut für Controlling, Finanz- und Risikomanagement Werner-Heisenberg-Weg 39 85577 Neubiberg Germany michael.oellinger@unibw.de

#### Friedrich L. Sell (corresponding author)

Universität der Bundeswehr München / Bundeswehr University Munich Institut für Ökonomie und Recht der globalen Wirtschaft Werner-Heisenberg-Weg 39 85577 Neubiberg Germany friedrich.sell@unibw.de

# Herausgeber/Editors

Prof. Dr. Stefan D. Josten Prof. Dr. Karl Morasch Prof. Dr. Friedrich L. Sell

Bis zum Jahr 2008 (20. Jg.) erschien diese Reihe unter dem Titel: Until 2008 published as: "Diskussionsbeiträge des Instituts für Volkswirtschaftslehre der Universität der Bundeswehr München".

> Dieser Diskussionsbeitrag ist auch als elektronische Version verfügbar unter: An electronic version of this paper may be downloaded from: http://www.unibw.de/makro/forschung/diskussion

# On the distributional effects of minimum wages. A note

by

# Michael Öllinger und Friedrich L. Sell

Juli 2017

### Abstract

In this note, we recall that unions traditionally pursue a policy of pushing higher average wages and, at the same time, for a compression of the structure of wages and salaries, which is some sort of equity. Given the precipitous fall of union density in many, if not all, OECD countries, the actual good climate for minimum wage policy comes at no surprise. Despite the fact that unions do dislike the intervention of labor market policy to the detriment of tariff autonomy, we can show that minimum wages are capable of serving both of the above-mentioned goals of unions and also help increase the overall wage quota in the economy. Hence, It can be concluded that the unions have a double dividend when inviting policy makers to pursue a policy of minimum wages: both the average wage rate can be increased and the dispersion of wages be lowered, *ceteris paribus*.

**JEL Categories:** J51, J38, J41, J58

Keywords: strategy of unions, wage dispersion, average and minimum wages, wage quota

## On the distributional effects of minimum wages. A note

#### 1. Introduction

Unions traditionally pursue a policy of pushing higher average wages and, at the same time, for a compression of the structure of wages and salaries, which is some sort of equity. Given the precipitous fall of union density in many, if not all, OECD countries, the actual good climate for minimum wage policy comes at no surprise. Despite the fact that unions do dislike the intervention of labor market policy to the detriment of tariff autonomy, it can be shown easily that minimum wages are capable of serving both of the above-mentioned goals of unions and also help increase the overall wage quota in the economy. The latter, as it seems, continues to be a core variable when it comes to the discussion of the eternal conflict between labor and capital. This short paper is organized as follows: In the subsequent section, we recall briefly the other contributions on the subject. Thereafter, we present some simple algebra on the wage quota and possible strategies adopted by unions to raise the latter. Then, we present an analytical and graphical analysis of the impact of minimum wages on the density function of wages and salaries. A short conclusion at the end culminates the exposition.

#### 2. What does the recent literature say?

The majority of contributions on this subject have analyzed empirically the impact of minimum wages on some measures of overall inequality of the economy or society in concern. Such is the case in the contributions of Escobar Toledo (2014) on Mexico; Groisman (2014) on Argentina; Butcher, Dickens, and Manning (2012) on UK; Bosch Mossi and Manacorda (2010) on Mexico; and Chun and Khor (2010) on Indonesia. Besides these, the more theoretical papers such as those of Belser and Rani (2015), Manning (2011) and Adam and Moutos (2006) either relate the issue to employment problems and possibilities or set up an institutional and sociological framework. In some cases, they also present the subject in a historical perspective. All these studies are thoughtful and have their own merits but leave aside the important aspect of regarding explicitly the distribution of wages and salaries before and after the introduction of minimum wages. This is what we address in the following section.

#### 3. Some simple algebra

(1) 
$$W = w_{ar} \cdot L$$

Total wage sum W is the product of the average wage rate,  $w_{ar}$ , and the number of employed, L. In turn, employment will be low (high) if the average wage rate  $w_{ar}$  is high (the dispersion of wages, measured by the standard deviation of wages,  $\sigma$ ):

(2) 
$$L = L(w_{ar}, \sigma)$$
 with  $\frac{\partial L}{\partial w_{ar}} < 0; \frac{\partial L}{\partial \sigma} > 0$ 

While the negative relationship between employment and wages is standard as long as the demand for labor is the short side of the labor market. The impact of a high standard deviation indicates a wage structure that resembles, as good as possible, the distribution of talents and capabilities and hence helps boost employment.

(3) 
$$Y = \beta \cdot L(w_{ar}, \sigma)$$
 with  $\beta = \beta(w_{ar}, \sigma)$  and  $\frac{\partial \beta}{\partial w_{ar}} > 0$ ;  $\frac{\partial \beta}{\partial \sigma} > 0$ 

Total output, Y, is the product of employment, L, and labor productivity,  $\beta$ . The latter, due to the effect of efficiency wages, is a positive function of the average wage rate and increases further with the standard deviation of wages and salaries. This effect represents the virtue of an optimal degree of labor division.

The unions interested in the wage quota (which, by the way, is equal to the real unit labor costs, RULC) have to consider the following equation:

(4) 
$$\operatorname{RULC} = \tilde{R} = \frac{W}{p \cdot Y} = \frac{W_{ar}}{\beta(w_{ar}, \sigma) \cdot p}$$

The determinants of changes in RULC can be determined by the total derivative:

(5) 
$$dRULC = d\tilde{R} = dw_{ar} \left[ 1 - \frac{\partial \beta}{\partial w_{ar}} \right] - d\sigma \frac{\partial \beta}{\partial \sigma} - dp$$

The growth rate of RULC, hence, reads as:

(6) 
$$\frac{dRULC}{RULC} = \frac{d\tilde{R}}{\tilde{R}} = \frac{dw_{ar} \left[1 - \frac{\partial\beta}{\partial w_{ar}}\right] - d\sigma \frac{\partial\beta}{\partial\sigma} - dp}{\left[w_{ar} : (\beta \cdot p)\right]}$$

The unions striving for a positive growth rate of the wage quota/RULC should aim at raising the average wage rate ( $dw_{ar} > 0$ ) and at reducing the dispersion of wages ( $d\sigma < 0$ ). The development of the inflation rate seems to be out of reach for unions.

#### 4. The distribution effect of minimum wages

Notice that in the most casual case of a log-normal distribution of wages, a higher dispersion of wages will elevate the average wage rate, *ceteris paribus*:

(7) 
$$dw_{ar} = (d\mu + \sigma \cdot d\sigma) \cdot e^{(\mu + 1/2\sigma^2)}$$

(see Beichelt and Montgomery 2003, pp. 46-48)

Figure 1 shows such a log-normal distribution of wages.



Figure 1: The stylized distribution pattern of wages. Source: Authors.

In order to determine the effect of introducing minimum wages, given such a distribution pattern, we used the statutory minimum wage rate of  $8.50 \in$  per hour, introduced in Germany on January 1, 2015, as an example. Two scenarios may emerge: the first one (**Figure 2**) distributes evenly the "lost density" sort over the rest of the density function. The second one (**Figure 3**) concentrates on the compensating density to the area on the right side of the minimum wage. This implies that the employees earning more than the minimum wage want to regain the distance to the lower wage group they already had before the minimum wage rate was introduced.

It is important to realize that, in both scenarios, the average wage rate increases ( $dw_{ar} > 0$ ) and the standard deviation decreases  $d\sigma < 0$ .



Figure 2: The subsidiary effect of a minimum wage rate, Case a. Source: authors.



Figure 3: The subsidiary effect of a minimum wage rate. Case b. Source: authors.

#### 5. Conclusion

It can be concluded that the unions have a double dividend when inviting policy makers to pursue a policy of minimum wages: both the average wage rate can be increased and the dispersion of wages be lowered, *ceteris paribus*.

#### 6. References

Adam, A./Moutos, T. (2006), Minimum wages, inequality and unemployment, in: Economics Letters, Vol. 92, No. 2, pp. 170-176.

Beichelt, F. E. /Montgomery, D. C. (2003), Teubner-Paperback of Stochastics: Probability Theory, Stochastic Processes, Mathematical Statistics (Teubner-Taschenbuch der Stochastik: Wahrscheinlichkeitstheorie, Stochastische Prozesse, Mathematische Statistik), 1st edn, Wiesbaden: Teubner-Verlag.

Belser, P./Rani, U., (2015), Minimum wages and inequality, in: Labour Markets, institutions and inequality: building just societies in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, Cheltenham: Edward Elgar, pp. 123-146.

Bosch Mossi, M./Manacorda, M. (2010), Minimum wages and earnings inequality in urban Mexico, in: American economic journal, Vol. 2, No. 4, pp. 128-149.

Bosch Mossi, M./Manacorda, M. (2008), Minimum wages and earnings inequality in urban Mexico, revisiting the evidence. CEP Discussion Paper 1990-; 880, London.

Butcher, T./Dickens, R./Manning, A, (2012), Minimum wages and wage inequality: some theory and an application to the UK, CEP Discussion Paper 1990-; 1177, London.

Chun, N./Khor, N. (2010), Minimum wages and changing inequality in Indonesia, ADB economics working paper series 2008- ; 196, Manila.

Escobar Toledo, S. (2014), Salarios minimos: desigualdad y desarrollo, in: Economiaunam, Vol. 11, No. 33, pp. 94-109.

Groisman, F. (2014), Employment, inequality and minimum wages in Argentina, in: Creative labor regulation: indeterminacy and protection in an uncertain world. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 87-125.

Manning, A. (2011), Employment in the lean years: policy and prospects for the next decade. Oxford University Press, pp. 134-150.

# In dieser Reihe sind zuletzt erschienen / Recently published:

	1	F
U	Ш	Э

27/01 **Sell, Friedrich L. und Öllinger, Michael,** Towards equilibrium in income distribution: theoretical background and empirical evidence for European Countries

## 2014

- 26/02 Zhu, Yanyuan und Xiao, Feng, China's National Production Function Since 1997:
  26/01 A Reinvestigation
- Sell, Friedrich L. und Ernst Ruf, Anmerkungen zum Monopson am Arbeitsmarkt II

### 2013

- 25/05 **Morasch, Karl,** Cooperation and Competition in Markets with Network Externalities or Learning Curves
- 25/04 Sell, Friedrich L., Werner, Thomas, Reinisch, David C., Price Effects of Minimum Wages: Evidence from the Construction Sector in East and West Germany
- 25/03 Bartholomae, Florian W., Networks, Hackers and Nonprotected Consumers
- 25/02 **Sell, Friedrich L. und Reinisch, David C.,** How do Beveridge and Philips curves in the Euro Area behave under the stress of the World Economic Crisis?
- 25/01 **Sell, Friedrich L. und Sauer, Beate,** Ist he Eurozone not a Monetary Union, bit an Extraordinary Exchange Rate Union?

## 2012

- 24/02 **Sell, Friedrich L. und David C. Reinisch,** Anmerkungen zum Monopson am Arbeitsmarkt: Der Zeithorizont macht den Unterscheid
- 24/01 Sell, Friedrich L. und Felix Stratmann, Verteilungs(un)gleichgewicht in Deutschland: Zweieinhalb theoretische Konzepte und fünf empirische Belege

## 2011

- 23/02 Sell, Friedrich L. und Beate Sauer, A Further View on Current Account, Capital Account and Target2 Balances: Assessing the Effect on Capital Structure and Economic Welfare
- 23/01 **Sell, Friedrich L. und Felix Stratmann,** Downs' ökonomische Theorie der Demokratie 2.0: Politische Präferenzen und Gleichheitsaversion

Universität der Bundeswehr München Fachgruppe Volkswirtschaftslehre an der Fakultät für Wirtschafts- und Organisationswissenschaften D – 85577 Neubiberg